US Domestic Politics, Nonproliferation Policy, and the NPT
QUESTIONS

I. What has been the connection between domestic politics and US nonproliferation policy. Three cases:
   - Israel
   - India and the Nuclear Nonproliferation Act of 1978
   - Saudi Arabia

II. What does this history suggest the role of US domestic politics is on nonproliferation policy generally?

III. What the implications are for the future of NPT?
ANSWERS TO QUESTION ONE

a) US sympathy and American Jewish support for Israel encouraged US Presidents to grandfather Israel’s nuclear weapons program.

b) Congressional outrage that US officials lied about the role of US nuclear exports played in India’s nuclear weapons program catalyzed support for the Nuclear Nonproliferation Act of 1978.

c) The souring of US support for the “reforming” Saudi regime after Khashoggi’s murder stiffened Congressional resistance to cutting a lax nuclear deal with the Kingdom.
ANSWERS TO QUESTION TWO

a) When it comes to nonproliferation rules, America coddles its friends and hammers its enemies.

b) Cover ups frequently produce political scandal that can be harnessed to tighten the rules.

c) The prospects of nuclear profits colors our government’s judgement: When the prospects for profits seem good, we favor lax rules; when they are poor, we are more open to being tough.

d) Unstable regimes can fall out of favor and move from being coddled to being hammered.
ANSWERS TO QUESTION THREE

a) Which of the two dominant interpretations of the NPT we choose to support depends heavily on how many countries we believe are worrisome. The fewer they are, the more likely we are to have a more generous view of how we will implement the treaty.

b) If one views the NPT primarily as a disarmament treaty, its future importance may decline significantly.
SPECIFIC CASES
ISRAEL

French to build Dimona, 08/57; 1st US reports 01/58, UK-Norwegian heavy water 1959, US learned 6 months later

Argentina sells Israel 80-100 tons of UO8, 1960-63. US confirms 1962

Kennedy, Ben Gurion, Eshkol agree to inspections, 1963

1968 200kgs UO8, German ship, Belgian ore, US aware (73)

Golda Meir & Richard Nixon 1969

Numec Plant, Apollo, PA 200-600 lbs., 65-76

1986 London Times, weapon mock-up
S. ATLANTIC FLASH, 1979: VELA SATELLITES DETECT LIGHT PATTERN OF NUCLEAR TEST

Light pattern for a known nuclear test

Light pattern of an unknown event on 9/22/79
INDIA

1960: CIRUS reactor commissioned—heavy water supplied by the United States

1963: Tarapur reactor built under 123 Agreement between United States and IAEA

1964: Construction of reprocessing plant at Trombay

1974: “Peaceful” test of Smiling Buddha
“(2) the Secretary of Energy may not enter into any subsequent arrangement for the reprocessing of any such material...unless...such reprocessing or retransfer will not result in a significant increase of the risk of proliferation beyond that which exists at the time that approval is requested. Among all the factors in making this judgement, foremost consideration will be given...under conditions that will ensure timely warning to the United States of any diversion well in advance of the time at which a non-nuclear weapon state could transform diverted material into a nuclear explosive device.”

- Section 128, NNPA, MAR. 10, 1978
e. The President shall keep the Committee on Foreign Affairs of the House of Representatives and the Committee on Foreign Relations of the Senate fully and currently informed of any initiative or negotiations relating to a new or amended agreement for peaceful nuclear cooperation pursuant to this section (except an agreement arranged pursuant to section 91 c., 144 b., 144 c., or 144 d., or an amendment thereto).

Section 123e, NNPA, MAR. 10, 1978
(c) The Department of State, the Arms Control and Disarmament Agency, the Department of Commerce, the Department of Energy, and the Commission shall keep the Committees on Foreign Relations and Governmental Affairs of the Senate and the Committee on International Relations of the House of Representatives fully and currently informed with respect to their activities to carry out the purposes and policies of this Act and to otherwise prevent proliferation, and with respect to the current activities of foreign nations which are of significance from the proliferation standpoint.

- Sec 602, NNPA, MAR. 10, 1978
“Saudi Arabia does not want to acquire any nuclear bomb, but without a doubt if Iran developed a nuclear bomb, we will follow suit as soon as possible.”

- Crown Prince Mohammed bin Salman, March 18, 2018
RIYADH’S LYING IS NOW NORMAL

“My understanding is he entered and he got out after a few minutes or one hour. I'm not sure. We are investigating this through the foreign ministry to see exactly what happened at that time.”
– Mohammed bin Salman, October 5

“The crime was really painful to all Saudis and I believe it is painful to every human in the world...It is a heinous crime that cannot be justified.”
– Mohammed bin Salman, October 24

“In Saudi Arabia our leadership is a red line. The custodian of the two holy mosques [King Salman] and the Crown Prince [Mohammed bin Salman] are a red line...They represent every Saudi citizen and every Saudi citizen represents them. And we will not tolerate any discussion of anything that is disparaging towards our monarch or our crown prince.”
– Foreign Minister Adel al-Jubeir, November 21
THE SAUDIS HAVE PREVIOUSLY HIDDEN NUCLEAR-CAPABLE MISSILES AND FACTORIES

CSS-2 (DF-3A) missiles at Saudi military parade

DF-21 missile

Saudi ballistic missile factory near Al-Watah
“I love the king, King Salman, but I said, ‘King we’re protecting you. You might not be there for two weeks without us.’”

- October 3, 2018
1 Iranian nuclear weapons option or nuclear weapon + 1 Saudi nuclear weapons option or nuclear weapon

= 0?
= 2?
OR
= >2?
WE HAVE BEEN HERE BEFORE

GUESS WHO’S BUILDING NUCLEAR POWER PLANTS.

The Shah of Iran is sitting on top of one of the largest reservoirs of oil in the world.
Yet he’s building two nuclear plants and planning two more to provide electricity for his country.
He knows the oil is running out—and time with it.
But he wouldn’t build the plants now if he doubted their safety. He’d wait. As many Americans want to do.
The Shah knows that nuclear energy is not only economical, it has enjoyed a remarkable 30-year safety record. A record that was good enough for the citizens of Plymouth, Massachusetts, too. They’ve approved their second nuclear plant by a vote of almost 4 to 1. Which shows you don’t have to go as far as Iran for an endorsement of nuclear power.

NUCLEAR ENERGY. TODAY’S ANSWER.
ANSWERS TO QUESTION TWO

a) When it comes to nonproliferation rules, America coddles it’s friends and hammers its enemies.

b) Cover ups frequently produce political scandal that can be harnessed to tighten the rules.

c) The prospects of nuclear profits colors our government’s judgement: When the prospects for profits seem good, we favor lax rules; when they are poor, we are more open to being tough.

d) Unstable regimes can fall out of favor and move from being coddled to being hammered
IS THE NPT ONE TREATY OR TWO?

Articles 1, 2, 3 VS. Articles 4, 5, 6, and 10
[“NPT] rested on three pillars: the balance between the obligation of militarily non-nuclear countries not to acquire nuclear weapons and the commitment of militarily nuclear countries to discharge their obligations under the Treaty in the matter of nuclear disarmament; the balance in the security conditions of Parties to the Treaty and the balance in the technological conditions and possibilities of all States which had acceded to the Treaty."

- Italian Representative, 1975 NPT Rev. Con
THREE PILLARS VIEW OF THE NPT

NONPROLIFERATION

DISARMAMENT

PEACEFUL NUCLEAR SHARING
ALTERNATIVE VIEW: ONE PILLAR, TWO STRUTS

PEACEFUL NUCLEAR SHARING

NONPROLIFERATION

DISARMAMENT
Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty Map

USA
First tested, and then dropped bombs on Hiroshima and Nagasaki in 1945. Joined the NPT in 1968.

South Sudan
Is the only African nation non signatory to the NPT.

UK
Tested its first nuclear weapon in 1952, and signed the Treaty in 1968.

France

Israel
Widely believed to possess sophisticated nuclear arsenal, though pursues policy of ambiguity over its possession.

Pakistan
Detonated its first nuclear explosion in 1998 as a response to nuclear tests made by India.

India

Russia
As the USSR, the country first conducted a nuclear test in 1949 and joined the NPT in 1968.

China

North Korea
Withdrew itself from the Treaty in 2003, and tested its first nuclear device in 2006.

NNW member states
Non signatory state with no nuclear weapons
NWS that signed the Treaty
Nuclear armed states not party to the NPT
Withdrawn from the Treaty